

EXHIBIT 16

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

NORTHERN DISTRICT

---000---

SOMTAI TROY CHAROENSAK, and
MARIANA ROSEN, individually,
and on behalf of all others
similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

No. C0500037 JW

APPLE COMPUTER, INC.,

Defendants.

_____/

DEPOSITION OF SOMTAI TROY CHAROENSAK

Taken before EARLY K. LANGLEY, RMR

CSR No. 3537

January 12, 2007

1 DEPOSITION OF SOMTAI TROY CHAROENSAK

2
3 BE IT REMEMBERED, that pursuant to Notice, and on
4 the 12th day of January 2007, commencing at the hour of
5 9:07 a.m., in the offices of Jones Day, 555 California
6 Street, 26th Floor, San Francisco, California, before
7 me, EARLY K. LANGLEY, a Certified Shorthand Reporter,
8 personally appeared SOMTAI TROY CHAROENSAK, produced as
9 a witness in said action, and being by me first duly
10 sworn, was thereupon examined as a witness in said
11 cause.
12

13 ---o0o---
14

15 ROY A. KATRIEL, The Katriel Law Firm, 1101 30th
16 Street NW, Suite 500, Washington, D.C. 20007, appeared
17 on behalf of the Plaintiff.
18

19 MICHAEL M. GOLDBERG, Glancy, Binkow & Goldberg,
20 LLP, 1801 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 311, Los Angeles,
21 California 90067, appeared on behalf of the Plaintiff.
22
23
24
25

1 ROBERT A. MITTELSTAEDT, TRACY STRONG, Jones
2 Day, 555 California Street, 26th Floor, San Francisco,
3 California, appeared on behalf of the Defendant Apple
4 Computer.

5
6 ALSO PRESENT: Nick Silva, Tele-Video
7 Production Services, Oakland, California.

1 Case No. C0500037 JW, filed in the United
2 States District Court, Northern District of
3 California.

4 This deposition was noticed by Robert
5 Mittelstaedt for the defendant.

6 Would the counsel for the parties please
7 identify themselves and for whom they're
8 appearing.

9 MR. KATRIEL: Good morning. Roy Katriel
10 from the Katriel Law Firm in Washington, D.C. on
11 behalf of the defendant.

12 MR. GOLDBERG: Michael Goldberg, Glancy,
13 Binkow & Goldberg, on behalf of the plaintiff.

14 MS. STRONG: Tracy Strong, Jones Day, on
15 behalf of the defendant.

16 MR. MITTELSTAEDT: Bob Mittelstaedt, Jones
17 Day, defendant.

18 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Would the counsel
19 please state any stipulations or statements that
20 they would like on the record at this time?

21 MR. MITTELSTAEDT: None.

22 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The court reporter may
23 now swear in the witness.

24 SOMTAI TROY CHAROENSAK,
25 sworn as a witness,

1 testified as follows:

2 EXAMINATION BY MR. MITTELSTAEDT:

3 Q. Would you state your full name and
4 address, please?

5 A. My name is Somtai Troy Charoensak. And my
6 address is 2636-24th Avenue San Francisco,
7 California 94116.

8 Q. And would you do me a favor and just
9 pronounce your last name slowly one more time?

10 A. It's pronounced Charoensak.

11 Q. Charoensak?

12 A. So phonetically I guess it's J-u-l-u-n and
13 then "sack."

14 Q.

15 A.

16 Q

17 A.

18 Q.

19 A.

20 Q. Have you ever had your deposition taken
21 before?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Let's take a couple of minutes and talk
24 about the procedure to make sure you're
25 comfortable with it.

REDACTED

1 time, my -- my computer doesn't have a lot of --
2 didn't have a lot of storage capacity, so I would
3 delete the music, thinking that I had it on my
4 iPOD, and that, because I purchased it, it is mine
5 and I could, you know, later use it, but I soon
6 realized that that is not the case.

7 Q. So, initially, you got the music into your
8 iTunes library, put it onto your iPOD, and then
9 deleted it from the iTunes library on your
10 computer?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. And then when you wanted to burn a CD with
13 that music that you had deleted, you encountered
14 problems, is that what you are saying?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. And then at some point, did you stop
17 deleting the music from the iTunes library on your
18 computer?

19 A. Yes, I did.

20 Q. And once you stopped deleting that music,
21 then were you able to burn CDs?

22 A. Only on that computer, yes.

23 Q. So the problem that you encountered was
24 that you were deleting music from the iTunes
25 library and that made it impossible, as you

1 understood it at least, to burn CDs with that
2 music that had been deleted; right?

3 A. Correct.

4 Q. And that's the problem you were
5 complaining to Ms. Wong about?

6 A. Not -- not exactly.

7 Q. Okay. What problem were you complaining
8 to Ms. Wong about then?

9 A. That I was -- I was locked out of the
10 music that I purchased. I think that's the main
11 complaint, that I realized that the music on my
12 iPOD, although that I paid for it and it was mine,
13 I had no access to it. That was the main
14 complaint that I had. The fact that I couldn't
15 burn a CD was just a result of that, that I was
16 locked out of my own music that I purchased.

17 Q. Well, you weren't locked out of it as you
18 used that term, as long as you kept the music in
19 your iTunes library on your computer; correct?

20 A. I -- I was locked out of it because I had
21 only one choice of being able to use that music.
22 It was either on my iPOD or in the iTunes that I
23 initially purchased the iTunes on the computer
24 that I used to purchase the music, and then any
25 other time I would try to have access to that file

1 I would not be able to have access to it.

2 Q. Okay. When you -- when you keep the music
3 from Apple Store in the iTunes library, you
4 continue to have access to it; correct?

5 A. Just on the computer that I purchase, and
6 using the iTunes, yes.

7 Q. And you know you can also burn a copy of
8 that music as long as you have not deleted it from
9 your iTunes library; correct?

10 A. I know that, yes, yes.

11 Q. When did you learn that?

12 A. After -- well, after I deleted the file,
13 once or twice, I figured it out that I would have
14 to burn it on the computer that I purchased it,
15 and then I would be able to delete it because then
16 I had a -- a, I guess a backup or I would have the
17 CD.

18 Q. And have you done that now already, burned
19 copies of music that you downloaded from Apple?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. How many times have you done that?

22 A. I don't know the exact number.

23 Q. More than -- more than ten times?

24 A. I would say at least more than eight
25 times.

1 purchased that in late 2004.

2 Q. Do you remember the month?

3 A. I believe it's December but I'm not
4 totally sure on the exact month.

5 Q. And at that time, had you bought the new
6 G4 or the PowerBook yet?

7 A. Oh, G4. I don't believe so.

8 Q. So, as far as you can recall, the computer
9 you were using when you bought the iPod was the
10 Dell laptop or the first G4, is that correct?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Where did you buy the iPod?

13 A. The iPod I purchased in Stonestown at an
14 Apple Store.

15 Q. And what model did you get?

16 A. I -- I don't know the exact model but it's
17 the 20 gigabyte.

18 Q. How much did you pay for it?

19 A. I paid less -- a little less than \$300. I
20 had a student discount.

21 Q. How much was the student discount worth?

22 A. I believe 10 percent, but I'm not sure on
23 the exact amount.

24 Q. How did you decide to buy an iPod?

25 A. I decided to buy an iPod -- well, first I

1 was looking at all the MP3 players that were
2 available, and at that time, the two that I was
3 looking at was the iPOD and the, I believe it is
4 the Rio, the Rio.

5 And at that time one of my co-workers had
6 a Rio that she used to go to the gym with and it
7 was a lot less than the iPOD, but the ability to
8 use iTunes -- she couldn't use iTunes with that,
9 and also, she didn't -- she couldn't -- I believe
10 at the time she couldn't -- she had problems
11 storing data files which was one of the reasons
12 that I wanted to buy an iPOD also because I needed
13 to store huge movie files from school, so I needed
14 something I could also use as an external hard
15 drive.

16 And so I decided to pay an extra for an
17 iPOD because I would have access to iTunes and I
18 would be able to use it as an external hard drive.
19 And also a big thing was that the Rio, I remember
20 I couldn't -- I didn't -- it wasn't Mac
21 compatible, I believe, and so I just decided to
22 spend the extra money and get an iPOD that I could
23 use, you know, for school. That was one of the
24 big reasons.

25 And at the time, the whole thing that

1 forced me to go that direction was I was using a
2 disk player and it had gotten stolen at the gym,
3 so I had no -- nothing. So I figured that I was
4 going to spend \$100 for a new disk player, I might
5 as well invest in an MP3 player. And that's when
6 I started looking for an MP3 player.

7 And also, at the time, at school, I was
8 having to burn huge amount of data onto CDs, so it
9 was taking a lot of time, so I needed something I
10 could use as an external hard drive.

11 Q. Any other reason that you bought an iPOD?

12 A. Yeah. I think those were the three
13 deciding factors.

14 Q. Okay. At the time you were using a CD
15 player?

16 A. Right.

17 Q. That's what you were referring to by the
18 disk player?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And, so you were going to replace that and
21 your decision was do you buy another CD player or
22 do you buy an MP3 player?

23 A. Yeah. At that time, it was about \$100 for
24 another disk player, and at that time, my
25 co-worker had an MP3 player, and she was like why

1 Q. The difference was more than \$100?

2 A. The difference was more than \$100, yes.

3 Q. Did your friend or your co-worker,
4 Ms. Hill, tell you she was satisfied with her Rio?

5 A. No, she was -- she -- she didn't -- she
6 had some kind of problem with it. I forgot
7 exactly what it was, but she -- no, she didn't
8 really like the Rio she had.

9 Q. Was that another factor that led you to
10 buy an iPOD?

11 A. Yes, it was.

12 Q. Now, when you bought the iPOD, how did you
13 intend to use it?

14 A. I intended to use it to listen to my
15 music. I wanted to transfer the CDs that I own on
16 to the MP3 player so that I could have access to
17 it, you know, on the train, or in the gym. And I
18 also intended to use it as an external hard drive.

19 Q. And what music did you have at the time?

20 A. Just CDs.

21 Q. And were you able to use the iPOD in the
22 way that you had envisioned?

23 A. Yeah. Uh-huh.

24 Q. Okay. When you went to Stonestown to buy
25 the Apple iPOD, did you -- do you remember talking

1 Q. And how did you go about putting your CD
2 collection onto your iPOD?

3 A. I just, you know, insert the CD and then
4 import through iTunes.

5 Q. And so you would get the music into your
6 iTunes library?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. On your computer; right?

9 A. Right.

10 Q. And then how would you get it from there
11 to your iPOD?

12 A. Just drag and drop.

13 Q. When you say you were transferring, in
14 effect, your CD collection, where did you get the
15 CDs? Were they all CDs that you had purchased?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Were there any CDs that you had burned
18 yourself?

19 A. Yes, I believe so.

20 Q. And can you estimate for me what, about
21 how many CDs you put onto your computer and then
22 onto your iPOD?

23 A. I would say approximately 75 percent of
24 the music that I have on my iPOD currently is from
25 my CD collection.

1 As of the time you bought the iPOD, do you think
2 you had any music that was actually stored in any
3 of your computers, you know, whether in the iTunes
4 library, or in these other Windows applications?

5 A. I don't believe so. You mean like in, I
6 guess, in Windows it has that My Music Folder?

7 Q. Right.

8 A. Yeah. I don't believe I had any music
9 stored in those. If I -- if I recall correctly, I
10 think that there is some kind of sample music that
11 comes automatically downloaded, but I've never --
12 I don't recall personally putting music into that
13 prior to having iTunes.

14 Q. And that's because up to that point, you
15 had used the computer just to play the music from
16 your CD collection rather than to store it; is
17 that right?

18 A. Correct. Yes.

19 Q. And is it also correct that at the time
20 you bought the iPOD, you had not bought any music
21 from Apple's online store, is that correct?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. You first bought music from Apple's online
24 store after you bought the iPOD; correct?

25 A. Yes.

1 STATE OF CALIFORNIA)

2)

3 COUNTY OF ALAMEDA)

4
5 I, EARLY K. LANGLEY, do hereby certify:

6 That SOMTAI TROY CHAROENSAK, in the foregoing
7 deposition named, was present and by me sworn as a
8 witness in the above-entitled action at the time
9 and place therein specified;

10 That said deposition was taken before me at
11 said time and place, and was taken down in
12 shorthand by me, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of
13 the State of California, and was thereafter
14 transcribed into typewriting, and that the
15 foregoing transcript constitutes a full, true and
16 correct report of said deposition and of the
17 proceedings that took place;

18 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunder
19 subscribed my hand this 14th day of January 2007.


20
21
22
23
24
25

EARLY K. LANGLEY, CSR No. 3537
State of California

EXHIBIT 17

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

SOMTAI TROY CHAROENAK AND MARIANNA)
ROSEN, etc.,)
 Plaintiffs,)
) Civil Action C-05-00037
) vs.)
))
))
APPLE COMPUTER, INC.,)
))
 Defendant.)
_____)

DEPOSITION OF MARIANNA ROSEN

January 24, 2007

236593



(310) 207.8000	Los Angeles	(916) 922.5777	Sacramento	(818) 702.0202	San Fernando Valley
(949) 955.0400	Orange County	(408) 885.0550	San Jose	(858) 455.5444	San Diego
(415) 433.5777	San Francisco	(951) 686.0606	Inland Empire	(760) 322.2240	Palm Springs

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S :

THE KATRIEL LAW FIRM
Attorneys for Plaintiffs
1101 30th Street, N.W.
Suite 500
Washington, D.C. 20007
BY: ROY A. KATRIEL, ESQ.

JONES DAY
Attorneys for Defendant
555 California Street
26th Floor
San Francisco, California 94104
BY: ROBERT A. MITTELSTAEDT, ESQ.

A L S O P R E S E N T :

THOMAS DELVECCHIO, Videographer

10:15:37 1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is tape
10:15:38 2 number one of the videotaped deposition of
10:15:40 3 Marianna Rosen taken by Defendant in the
10:15:43 4 matter of Somtai Troy Charoenak, et al.,
10:15:50 5 Plaintiffs versus Apple Computer, Inc.,
10:15:53 6 Defendant, in the United States District
10:15:53 7 Court for the Northern District of
10:15:57 8 California, Civil Action No. C-05-00037.

10:16:06 9 This deposition is being held at the
10:16:07 10 office of Jones Day, 222 East 41st Street,
10:16:13 11 New York, New York. Today is Wednesday,
10:16:17 12 January 24th, 2007. The time is 10:17 a.m.

10:16:24 13 My name is Thomas Delvecchio from
10:16:26 14 the firm of Barclay Court Reporters. I am
10:16:29 15 the legal video specialist.

10:16:31 16 The court reporter is Josephine
10:16:32 17 Fassett in association with Barclay Court
10:16:35 18 Reporters.

10:16:39 19 For the record will counsel please
10:16:41 20 introduce themselves?

10:16:43 21 MR. MITTELSTAEDT: Bob Mittelstaedt
10:16:43 22 for Apple.

10:16:45 23 MR. KATRIEL: Good morning. Roy
10:16:46 24 Katriel from The Katriel Law Firm for the
10:16:49 25 Plaintiffs.

10:16:49 1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.

10:16:51 2 Now will the court reporter please

10:16:51 3 swear the witness?

10:16:59 4 M A R I A N N A R O S E N, the witness, having

10:16:59 5 been duly sworn, was examined and testified

10:16:59 6 under oath as follows:

10:17:00 7 EXAMINATION BY

10:17:01 8 MR. MITTELSTAEDT:

10:17:02 9 Q Good morning.

10:17:03 10 A Good morning.

10:17:03 11 Q If you would state your full name

10:17:05 12 and address for the record, please.

10:17:07 13 A Marianna Rosen, 236 Tillou Road,

10:17:08 14 South Orange, New Jersey, the Zip Code is 07079.

10:17:14 15 Q And you're aware you're under oath

10:17:16 16 today, correct?

10:17:17 17 A I am aware.

10:17:19 18 Q Have you given testimony before

10:17:19 19 either in court or by way of deposition?

10:17:22 20 A I don't think so. I mean, when I

10:17:24 21 became an American Citizen I guess that was sort

10:17:27 22 of a similar process. I had to do an oath. I

10:17:30 23 don't think I ever -- no, I was robbed four years

10:17:35 24 ago on the corner, or three years ago on the

10:17:38 25 corner of my street and of course I gave the

10:41:43 1 vinyl records?

10:41:43 2 Q The vinyl.

10:41:43 3 MR. KATRIEL: You're talking about

10:41:44 4 records?

10:41:45 5 MR. MITTELSTAEDT: Yeah, records.

10:41:45 6 A I know. Unfortunately I don't think

10:41:48 7 I do.

10:41:52 8 Q How many CD's do you have that you

10:41:54 9 have burned?

10:42:00 10 A Maybe 10.

10:42:06 11 Q And those are CD's you burned from

10:42:09 12 music you bought from Apple?

10:42:11 13 A No. As I said, this could be

10:42:14 14 combination. If I use the iTunes software, I load

10:42:18 15 a physical CD that I bought in a store or somebody

10:42:23 16 gave to me, I choose some songs from there. It

10:42:26 17 may be a mixture, I may have some songs that are

10:42:28 18 from a physical CD that I loaded, it may be some

10:42:31 19 songs I bought from Apple, it may be a combination

10:42:33 20 of two CD's that I bought.

10:42:36 21 Q And then you make a play list and

10:42:37 22 then you burn the play list?

10:42:39 23 A Right, exactly.

10:42:39 24 Q And then when you burn a CD in that

10:42:43 25 fashion, how do you use the CD?

10:42:48 1 A To play it in a car most of the time
10:42:50 2 because I cannot listen to the iPod say in the
10:42:53 3 car.

10:42:57 4 Q And have you ever copied that CD
10:43:00 5 back onto your computer?

10:43:03 6 A The CD that I already burned?

10:43:05 7 Q Yes.

10:43:06 8 A No. Why would I do that?

10:43:13 9 Q Do you -- let's walk through the
10:43:15 10 process that you use to make -- first of all,
10:43:20 11 let's walk through the process you used to copy a
10:43:24 12 CD into your Dell computer.

10:43:26 13 A Uh-hum.

10:43:26 14 Q Could you just walk through how you
10:43:28 15 do that?

10:43:29 16 A Well, I take a CD and install it
10:43:32 17 into the drive, the iTunes open up, and I usually
10:43:39 18 would create a play list and copy the songs that
10:43:45 19 appear in the window. I might do it in some
10:43:47 20 backward fashion. Copy the songs that appear in
10:43:50 21 the window that I like, or sometimes it's the
10:43:53 22 whole CD, into the play list and it will
10:43:55 23 automatically be saved into the general iTunes
10:43:59 24 library as well.

10:44:00 25 Q Do you pay any attention to the

10:44:04
10:44:08
10:44:10
10:44:12
10:44:17
10:44:21
10:44:24
10:44:28
10:44:32
10:44:39
10:44:40
10:44:41
10:44:44
10:44:46
10:44:51
10:44:56
10:44:59
10:45:01
10:45:03
10:45:06
10:45:09
10:45:14
10:45:19
10:45:21
10:45:23

1 format that's being used to copy the music, copy
2 the CD into iTunes?

3 A You know, I did actually recently
4 because when I realized that I cannot load any
5 other music away from iTunes. In other words, I
6 don't know exactly what the format name but I
7 realized that if I go to any other Web site that
8 legally sells music, I cannot download, buy and
9 download this music into My iTunes. In other
10 words --

11 Q Go ahead.

12 A -- the two ways that I can actually
13 get my music into the software is, A, to purchase
14 it from Apple, or B, to copy it from existing CD,
15 you know, hard CD.

16 Q You say that you recently realized
17 you can't load music from --

18 A Well, recently may be a year ago.
19 To answer this year question. I do aware that
20 there is a certain format exist in which music can
21 be saved, and this is different, and Apple uses
22 one format, the other companies -- I mean the
23 other music could come in a different format.
24 That's to answer your question.

25 Q But when you said that you realized

11:00:19 1 A Well, I wanted to work out with
11:00:21 2 something that would not skip as a CD player and I
11:00:30 3 just think -- I don't remember why I choose iPod
11:00:34 4 over it, maybe the advertising was all over in my
11:00:38 5 face, I don't remember.

11:00:40 6 Q Have you heard people say that the
11:00:42 7 iPod's cool?

11:00:43 8 A You know, I don't really socialize
11:00:45 9 with very young people fortunately or
11:00:48 10 unfortunately who would refer iPod to me.

11:00:51 11 Q Okay. But have you heard the iPod
11:00:53 12 referred to as the cool factor?

11:00:55 13 A Well, that's not why I bought it.
11:00:58 14 Maybe I heard.

11:01:00 15 Q But did you shop around and compare
11:01:02 16 the iPod with others?

11:01:04 17 A No. You know what happened, it's
11:01:07 18 there in Short Hills Mall and I walked -- and I
11:01:10 19 heard about iPod, because they have very good
11:01:13 20 advertising, and I happened to like Macintosh a
11:01:15 21 lot, and I don't think I ever owned one, but I
11:01:18 22 really loved the way it looked, so I just went and
11:01:21 23 bought it.

11:01:22 24 Q Did you like the way the iPod
11:01:24 25 looked?

11:01:24 1 A Yes.

11:01:25 2 Q I mean, did you try it out at the

11:01:27 3 store before you bought it?

11:01:28 4 A No, I just went and bought it.

11:01:30 5 Q What did you like about its looks?

11:01:34 6 A Well, I mean, I like it's kind of

11:01:34 7 slim and, you know, it looks nice.

11:01:36 8 Q Did you feel like anything or

11:01:38 9 anybody forced you to buy the iPod?

11:01:44 10 A The first iPod for sure, no.

11:01:47 11 Q And you could have bought any other

11:01:50 12 mp3 player at the time if you had wanted to,

11:01:52 13 right?

11:01:54 14 A I guess. There was no force. The

11:01:56 15 first, no.

11:01:57 16 Q When you were at the Apple store,

11:01:59 17 did you talk, the first time when you bought your

11:02:02 18 first iPod, did you talk with anybody at Apple

11:02:04 19 about the iPod or about your decision-making

11:02:07 20 process?

11:02:08 21 A I don't remember. Well, you know, I

11:02:11 22 might have discussed how to use it which -- I mean

11:02:14 23 maybe we talked about the megabytes, gigabytes or

11:02:19 24 whatever, the memory size that is, and which one

11:02:24 25 makes more sense for me.

11:18:08 1 Q Okay. Do you know -- well, let me
11:18:11 2 just ask you this: Did anybody force you to buy
11:18:14 3 that for her?
11:18:15 4 A She. She forced me to buy that for
11:18:18 5 her. She said she wants an iPod. I said what do
11:18:24 6 you want for your birthday? I said cool, I will
11:18:26 7 get you an iPod Mini.
11:18:29 8 Q Did she tell you why she wanted an
11:18:31 9 iPod?
11:18:32 10 A She said she wants to work out, she
11:18:34 11 needs to lose weight. That was as far as we went.
11:18:35 12 Q But did she tell you why an iPod
11:18:37 13 rather than another mp3 player?
11:18:40 14 A I don't think we had that
11:18:42 15 conversation at all.
11:18:43 16 Q Were you aware at that time that
11:18:43 17 there were other mp3 players that could be used
11:18:47 18 for working out and playing digital music?
11:18:50 19 A Maybe.
11:18:51 20 Q What do you mean "maybe"?
11:18:53 21 A Probably I was aware, I don't
11:18:54 22 remember. I'm aware -- I'm aware of it now for
11:18:58 23 sure and I know I probably knew about it, because
11:19:01 24 I think I met a guy in a gym who was using
11:19:05 25 something else, so I knew that.

11:49:08 1 bought any new device other than iPod, I would
11:49:12 2 assume it either will have to come with some
11:49:15 3 software or I can use the existing computer
11:49:18 4 software which came like Windows Media Player or
11:49:21 5 something like that, and I would go to other Web
11:49:23 6 sites that are out there and buy music from them
11:49:30 7 and burn my CD's, load them into computer, and
11:49:34 8 then transfer them into my mp3 player, but I never
11:49:38 9 looked into that closely, so I really don't know.

11:49:41 10 Q Okay. Do you have any understanding
11:49:44 11 as to whether if you bought a competing mp3 player
11:49:50 12 you could use all of the music in your iTunes
11:49:55 13 library just by having another library, either
11:49:58 14 Windows Media or some other library on your
11:50:02 15 computer?

11:50:02 16 A You mean, let me rephrase the
11:50:05 17 question. You mean, could I transfer the music
11:50:07 18 from iTunes library into an XYZ library and copy
11:50:12 19 it into the new mp3 player?

11:50:15 20 Q Correct.

11:50:16 21 A And the question is?

11:50:17 22 Q Is it your understanding that you
11:50:19 23 can do that?

11:50:19 24 A My understanding is that I cannot do
11:50:21 25 that.

11:50:21 1 Q Even with your CD collection that
11:50:24 2 you burned onto your computer or copied onto your
11:50:27 3 computer?

11:50:29 4 A I don't know if the CD is because
11:50:32 5 actually now that you started me thinking the CD
11:50:35 6 maybe I would be able to copy, but I don't think
11:50:38 7 so. I think that anything that is on an iTunes
11:50:42 8 library I can only use with iPod. iTunes, iPod,
11:50:47 9 clear I cannot use.

11:50:51 10 Q And so your belief is that if you
11:50:54 11 got a competing mp3 player you'd have to start all
11:50:57 12 over and copy your CD's from the physical CD into
11:51:01 13 a different library, get music from other music
11:51:04 14 stores, put it into the different library; is that
11:51:07 15 correct?

11:51:07 16 A Right.

11:51:07 17 Q Now that we've talked about this
11:51:10 18 some more, can you tell me where you got that
11:51:14 19 idea?

11:51:19 20 A I'm thinking. I'm trying to. I
11:51:27 21 mean, I don't remember if somebody told me that in
11:51:30 22 a store, it's possible, or it could be that I'm
11:51:33 23 just understanding it because Apple names their
11:51:36 24 products in such way that I just start thinking
11:51:40 25 that this is, you know, Apple products and you

12:07:10 1 on iPod.

12:07:12 2 Q Does your son watch cartoons on the

12:07:14 3 iPod?

12:07:14 4 A He is not allowed, but he does.

12:07:17 5 They're there, I mean, I don't even know how to

12:07:20 6 delete them. So like, for example, I loaded, I

12:07:25 7 wanted to know what this thing, all this noise

12:07:28 8 about this group Strokes, this New York City group

12:07:31 9 Strokes and I bought a video, you know, how do you

12:07:37 10 say it, video clip from iTunes for that music, and

12:07:40 11 it's a little explicit, but somehow it's in my

12:07:45 12 iPod. I mean not somehow, I know that it should

12:07:48 13 be in my iPod, I synched it, and my son saw it, so

12:07:53 14 I'm not nuts about him watching it.

12:07:54 15 Q Okay. So he does watch videos on

12:07:56 16 your iPod?

12:07:58 17 A Sometimes.

12:08:09 18 Q When you bought the newest iPod, did

12:08:12 19 you think to yourself that you were paying too

12:08:16 20 much for it?

12:08:20 21 A Surely of course, I thought it was

12:08:21 22 expensive, I think all iPods are very expensive.

12:08:25 23 Q When you bought the first iPod, did

12:08:26 24 you think it was expensive?

12:08:28 25 A I thought it was expensive.

01:34:31 1 Q Has your husband done anything other
01:34:33 2 than talk to you in an effort to get other people
01:34:36 3 to join?
01:34:36 4 A No.
01:34:47 5 Q When you bought your iPod, did
01:34:50 6 anyone at Apple tell you you couldn't buy an iPod
01:34:54 7 unless you also agreed to buy music from Apple's
01:34:57 8 online music store?
01:35:00 9 A I don't remember. Which iPod you
01:35:03 10 referring to? Both?
01:35:05 11 Q Any of the three.
01:35:07 12 A I don't think so, no.
01:35:13 13 Q Can you use your iPod without ever
01:35:16 14 buying any music from Apple?
01:35:21 15 A In other words, can I use my iPod
01:35:24 16 with only the CD's that I loaded?
01:35:27 17 Q Let's start there. You can use your
01:35:29 18 iPod with CD's that you load without ever buying
01:35:32 19 any music from Apple, correct?
01:35:34 20 A Well, nobody forces me to give them
01:35:37 21 a credit card and buy music, that's clear, but why
01:35:41 22 would I not?
01:35:42 23 Q Well, could you just answer the
01:35:45 24 question? You can use an iPod to play music from
01:35:49 25 your music collection, from your CD collection,

01:58:36 1 Q When he buys music from iTunes Music
01:58:39 2 Store, what does he do with it, if you know?
01:58:42 3 A Oh, just I think once he loaded some
01:58:47 4 music and we made a little CD with it to go, when
01:58:50 5 we were traveling and went to Miami and wanted to
01:58:54 6 listen in the car. And sometimes he just buys the
01:58:57 7 music for our son that he thinks our son would
01:59:01 8 like.
01:59:02 9 Q Okay.
01:59:02 10 A And then whatever our son does with
01:59:04 11 that, which is listen to it.
01:59:07 12 Q Looking at this first set of pages
01:59:08 13 16 to 17, can you tell us or approximate how many
01:59:11 14 of these songs you or your husband has burned to a
01:59:16 15 CD?
01:59:17 16 A I think if I had to hum and all that
01:59:27 17 line?
01:59:29 18 Q Yes.
01:59:31 19 A Is something that we made a CD with,
01:59:43 20 you know, burning copy on a CD.
01:59:57 21 And Here It Is, By the River Dark,
02:00:00 22 Alexandra Leaving, You Have Loved Enough, I think
02:00:04 23 that's also. I think it was just one CD that he
02:00:06 24 made.
02:00:12 25 Q And do you have at home all the CD's

02:39:57 1 A No, I did not tell him that.

02:39:59 2 Q Was there any similar model that

02:40:02 3 didn't have video?

02:40:04 4 A I don't remember. I think they all

02:40:05 5 had videos in the big ones. In other words, in

02:40:08 6 the big ones meaning the full-blown iPod as

02:40:11 7 opposed to Mini.

02:40:13 8 Q Okay. And if there had been a

02:40:14 9 full-blown iPod, to use your description, without

02:40:18 10 the video, that's what you wanted to purchase,

02:40:20 11 right?

02:40:21 12 A I could have purchased that. I

02:40:22 13 could have purchased the one that's video. It's

02:40:25 14 just a nice edition, it didn't hurt to have the

02:40:28 15 video. It's not like I was objecting to that.

02:40:30 16 Q Because, in fact, your son has used

02:40:33 17 the video to watch cartoons, right?

02:40:34 18 A Yeah, but I'm actually against that.

02:40:37 19 Q And another reason that you bought

02:40:40 20 the iPod was you didn't think you could transfer

02:40:45 21 your CD collection to a competing mp3 player

02:40:51 22 without starting over and copying these physical

02:40:55 23 CD's into a new library, correct?

02:40:57 24 A Let me rephrase it a little bit. I

02:41:00 25 wouldn't say another reason. The only reason, I

02:41:03 1 mean the main reason I bought iTunes -- I'm
02:41:06 2 sorry -- iPod is because I wanted to use my iTunes
02:41:09 3 because I knew I could only, I knew, I thought,
02:41:13 4 that I can only use my iTunes library on an iPod.
02:41:17 5 Q And that's something you had thought
02:41:20 6 from the first time you used an iPod, right?
02:41:23 7 A More or less again.
02:41:25 8 MR. MITTELSTAEDT: Okay.
02:41:26 9 MR. KATRIEL: I have nothing
02:41:27 10 further. Thank you.
02:41:27 11 MR. MITTELSTAEDT: Thank you.
02:41:29 12 Just one second.
02:41:33 13 Okay. Thank you.
02:41:35 14 (Whereupon, witness excused.)
02:41:36 15 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is 2:43
02:41:37 16 p.m., Wednesday, January 24th, 2007. This
02:41:45 17 is the end of tape number two and completes
02:41:47 18 the videotaped deposition of Marianna
02:41:49 19 Rosen. We're off the record.
02:41:50 20 (Whereupon, off the record.)
02:42:46 21 (Whereupon, videotaped deposition
02:42:46 22 adjourned 2:42 p.m.)
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, JOSEPHINE H. FASSETT, a Certified
Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public within and for
the State of New York, do hereby certify that
the witness, MARIANNA ROSEN, whose videotaped
deposition is hereinbefore set forth, was sworn by me
on the date indicated, and that the foregoing
deposition is a true and accurate record of the
testimony given by such witness.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am not employed by
nor related to any of the parties to this action by
blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested
in the outcome of this matter.

Josephine H. Fassett

JOSEPHINE H. FASSETT, CSR, CLR

New York Notary Public